

Authors

Pia Raffler
Harvard University

Dan Posner
University of California, Los Angeles

Doug Parkerson
Senior Research Scientist

Can Citizen Pressure Be Induced to Improve Public Service Provision?

Pia Raffler ¹ Daniel N. Posner ² Doug Parkerson ³

This version: October 30, 2020

Word count: 11,714

Abstract

Encouraging citizens to apply pressure on underperforming service providers has emerged in recent years as a prominent response to the failure of states to provide needed services. We outline three theoretical mechanisms through which bottom-up citizen-oriented pressure campaigns may affect development outcomes and investigate them via a large-scale field experiment in the Ugandan health sector. While we find modest positive impacts on treatment quality and patient satisfaction, we find no effects on utilization rates, child mortality, or other health outcomes. We also find no evidence that citizens increased their monitoring or sanctioning of health workers. Our findings therefore cast doubt on the power of outside actors to generate bottom-up pressure by citizens or improvements in development outcomes. Held up against the findings of other, similar studies, our results point to the salience of mechanisms other than citizen pressure for improvements in service delivery, and to the importance of baseline health conditions for the success of bottom-up, citizen-oriented pressure campaigns. Such conditions shape outcomes both across countries and within countries over time, with the latter finding holding important implications for countries undergoing rapid socioeconomic change.¹

¹Department of Government, Harvard University, praffler@gov.harvard.edu.

²Department of Political Science, University of California, Los Angeles, dposner@polisci.ucla.edu.

³Innovations for Poverty Action, dougparkerson@poverty-action.org.

⁴Authors listed in reverse alphabetical order. We thank the Ministry of Health in Uganda, in particular Dr. Anthony Mubonyi, IPN Uganda, in particular Felicitas Cochisard, Martin Atiyera, Joshua Brum, Paul Elise, Albe Jagot, Kyle Holloway, Douglas Kassins, Steven Kizza, Ezra Ruskaschko, Laura Schmuckler, and Alex Tsimine for excellent research assistance and Danion Kirchhoffler, Dickson Malanda, and Daniele Renda for their dedicated project management. We thank our partners at GOAL Uganda, in particular Elizabeth Allen, Angela Bailey, Niamh Barry, and Fiona Mitchell; our implementing partners, Coalition for Health Promotion and Social Development, Kabarele Research and Resource Centre, and Multi-Community Based Development Initiative; and the Department for International Development for funding. Helpful comments were provided by participants at the 17th and 23rd EGAP meetings, and at seminars at Columbia, Emory, Rochester, Stanford, UC Berkeley, UCLA, Vancouver School of Economics, and the World Bank. The pre-analysis plan was registered at EGAP (ID 20190611AA). Human subjects approval was received under IPA IRB #2127. A working paper version of this paper was submitted for pre-publication review to the Abdul Latif Jameel Poverty Action Lab (J-PAL), where a code replication exercise was undertaken. We thank Georgy Sympson and Isabelle Cohen for conducting this re-analysis.

Can Citizen Pressure be Induced to Improve Public Service Provision?

Encouraging citizens to apply pressure on underperforming service providers has emerged in recent years as a prominent response to the failure of states to provide needed services. We outline three theoretical mechanisms through which bottom-up citizen-oriented pressure campaigns may affect development outcomes and investigate them via a large-scale field experiment in the Ugandan health sector. While we find modest positive impacts on treatment quality and patient satisfaction, we find no effects on utilization rates, child mortality, or other health outcomes. We also find no evidence that citizens increased their

monitoring or sanctioning of health workers. Our findings, therefore, cast doubt on the power of outside actors to generate bottom-up pressure by citizens or improvements in development outcomes. Held up against the findings of other, similar studies, our results point to the salience of mechanisms other than citizen pressure for improvements in service delivery, and to the importance of baseline health conditions for the success of bottom-up, citizen-oriented pressure campaigns. Such conditions shape outcomes both across countries and within countries over time, with the latter finding holding important implications for countries undergoing rapid socioeconomic change.

October 30, 2020