

# Service Delivery in India – Targeting, Leakages and Other Such Ills

#### **Impact and Policy Conference**

Bangkok, Thailand

August 31, 2012

#### **Varad Pande**

Ministry of Rural Development Government of India



- Major Rural Development Programmes in India
- What Leads to Leakages: Some Big Issues in Service Delivery
- Recent Innovations to address these
  - Biometrics Aadhaar
  - Concurrent Evaluation
- Key Takeaways



### Major Rural Development Programmes in India

#### Social Safety Nets

- 1. Employment (MNREGA)
- 2. Pensions (NSAP)

#### Rural Infrastructure

- 3. Rural Roads (PMGSY)
- 4. Housing (IAY)
- 5. Drinking Water (NRDWP)
- 6. Sanitation (NBA)

#### Skill Development & Livelihoods

7. Aajeevika (NRLM)

- Funding by Central Government, Implementation by States
- Annual Budget ~Rs 99,000 crore (~USD 20Bn)



- Major Rural Development Programmes in India
- What Leads to Leakages: Some Big Issues in Service Delivery
- Recent Innovations to address these
  - Biometrics Aadhaar
  - Concurrent Evaluation
- Key Takeaways



## What Leads to Leakages: Some Big Issues in Service Delivery

#### 1. Top Down Design and Approach

- "One-size Fits All"
- Difficult to target, manage and monitor

#### 2. Multiple Layers of intermediaries

- Limited involvement of communities
- Diffusion of Responsibility and Disconnect

#### 3. Authentication

Confirming that the right person gets the benefit

#### 4. Weak Monitoring and Evaluation

• Limited (and anecdotal) evidence on what's going well, what's going wrong and where



- Major Rural Development Programmes in India
- What Leads to Leakages: Some Big Issues in Service Delivery
- Recent Innovations to address these
  - Biometrics Aadhaar
  - Concurrent Evaluation
- Key Takeaways

# **Recent Innovations to address these**



1. Top Down Design and Approach

Rural Flexi-Fund for the States

- Direct transfer of untied funds to States

2. Multiple Layers of Intermediaries

Restructuring our schemes

- e.g., Old Age Pensions

3. Authentication

Biometrics - Aadhaar

4. Weak Monitoring and Evaluations

Concurrent Evaluation Office

# **Recent Innovations to address these**



1. Top Down Design and Approach

Rural Flexi-Fund for the States

– Direct transfer of untied funds to States

2. Multiple Layers of Intermediaries

Restructuring our schemes – e.g., Old Age Pensions

3. Targeting and Leakages

**Biometrics - Aadhaar** 

4. Weak Monitoring and Evaluations

Concurrent Evaluation Office



### Potential of Biometrics (Aadhaar) in Reducing Leakages

- Tackles 'Duplicates' and 'Ghosts'
- Mobile identity that travels with the resident even when he/she moves or migrates
- Single biometric service available
  - Across all government schemes
  - By all banks
  - With uniform standards across country and apps



## But significant challenges remain...

### • Setting it Up:

- ~ 1 billion people need to be enrolled, universally (200 million already done!)
- Bank accounts need to be linked

#### • Technical Issues:

- Foolproof biometric recognition, especially for elderly/manual workers
- Connectivity
- Banking Network in the last mile

## **Recent Innovations to address these**



1. Top Down Design and Approach

Rural Flexi-Fund for the States

– Direct transfer of untied funds to States

2. Multiple Layers of

Restructuring our schemes – e.g., Old Age Pensions

3. Authentication

Biometrics - Aadhaar

4. Weak Monitoring and Evaluations



**Concurrent Evaluation Office** 



## Weaknesses with Current Monitoring and Evaluation

- Expenditure Obsession
  - Accountability of States is on "spending, no real incentives/disincentives for achievements of outcomes
- Evaluations ad hoc and ex-post, not Concurrent
  - Limited baselines, needs assessments, feasibility analysis
  - No consolidated/collective view of achievements across programmes
- Policy-loop is seldom closed



#### **Concurrent Evaluation Office (CEO)**

An **independent** organization to facilitate systematic rapid and **rigorous concurrent** evaluations through a **network** of institutions - a Concurrent Evaluation Network (CENET)

#### **Functions**

- 1. Identify appropriate concurrent evaluations to be done
- 2. For each study
  - Design ToRs
  - Identify institutions to undertake studies
  - Coordinate implementation
- 3. Identify learning and recommend policy changes
- 4. Review the "Action Taken Reports" of the Ministry
- 5. Disseminate findings and datasets

## **Concurrent Evaluation Office (CEO)**



### **A Dual Challenge**

On the one hand...

CEO should be **independent** and **professional** 

On the other hand...

CEO work should do relevant work, and feed into policy

#### How to reconcile these seemingly conflicting objectives?





#### **Independent & Professional**

- Formed as an independent society, not as a department/cell in the Ministry
- 2. Professional Governing Body with 5 independent experts
- 3. Director-General to be a Professional Economist with full functional autonomy and budget
- 4. Core Team (Researchers/YPs) hired from 'market', other services outsourced

#### ...Yet Embedded in the System

- Governing Body to have Ministry, Planning Commission, States representatives
- 2. Formal Consultation Process with Ministry and agreed Annual Work Plan codified as an MoU
- 3. Concept of 'Action Taken Reports' to be prepared by Ministry on recommendations of CEO



- Major Rural Development Programmes in India
- What Leads to Leakages: Some Big Issues in Service Delivery
- Recent Innovations to address these
  - Biometrics Aadhaar
  - Concurrent Evaluation

## Key Takeaways

#### **Key Takeaways**



- Service delivery challenges at scale (1.2 billion people) are large
- Many things wrong, but many things going right as well
- Innovative solutions required to address the issue at scale
  - More decentralisation and involvement of communities
  - Simplify programmes
  - Biometrics (Aadhaar)
  - Better Evaluations