

# Outcomes Appendix

The table below details the computation of important quantities that make up the analysis. For the formulas in the table,  $i$  indexes borrower,  $j$  and  $k$  index providers,  $l$  and  $m$  index loans (or loan applications), and  $t$  indexes time.

Outcome	Index	Concept and explanation	Formula or representation
Market size		Total number of providers	$J$
		Total accounts at provider $j$	$N_j^a$
	M1	Total accounts	$N^a = \sum_{j=1}^J N_j^a$
		Total number of disbursements for consumer $i$ at provider $j$	$N_{ij}^d$
		Total disbursements at provider $j$	$N_j^d = \sum_{i=1}^{N_j^a} N_{ij}^d$
	M2	Total disbursements	$N^d = \sum_{j=1}^J N_j^d$
	C1	Loan size: Value of disbursement for loan $l$ taken by consumer $i$ at provider $j$	$\text{value}_{ijt}^d$

	<b>M3</b>	Total value	$\text{Total value} = \sum_{j=1}^J \sum_{i=1}^{N_j^a} \sum_{l=1}^{N_{ij}^d} \text{value}_{ijl}^d$
Concentration and competition		Provider value	$\text{Total value}_j = \sum_{i=1}^{N_j^a} \sum_{l=1}^{L_i} \text{value}_{ijl}^d$
	<b>M5</b>	Market shares	$S_j = \frac{\text{Total value}_j}{\text{Total value}} \times 100\%$
	<b>M4</b>	HHI (Herfindahl-Hirschman Index)	$\text{HHI} = \sum_{j=1}^J S_j^2$
	<b>M6</b>	k-firm concentration ratio	$\text{Concentration Ratio} = \sum_{j=1}^k S_j$
Loan contracts		Normal fees (interest fees, facilitation fees, etc. for loan $l$ taken by individual $i$ )	Normal fees $_{ijl}$
		Contingent fees (rollover fees, penalty fees, etc. for loan $l$ taken by individual $i$ )	Contingent fees $_{ijl}$
		Cost	$\text{Cost}_{ijl} = \text{Normal fees}_{ijl} + \text{Contingent fees}_{ijl}$
	<b>C2</b>	Tenure	$\begin{aligned} \text{Tenure}_{ijl} &= \text{Due date}_{ijl} \\ &- \text{disbursement date}_{ijl} \end{aligned}$
	<b>P1</b>	Contracted APR (no contingent fees)	$\text{CAPR}_{ijl} = \left( \frac{\text{Normal fees}_{il}}{\text{value}_{ijl}^d} \frac{365 \text{ days}}{\text{Tenure}_{ijl}} \right) \times 100\%$

Repayment Behavior		Renegotiated	$\text{renegotiated}_{ijl}$ $= \mathbf{1}(\text{loan } l \text{ renegotiated})$
		Rollover	$\text{rollover}_{ijl} = \mathbf{1}(\text{loan } l \text{ rolled over})$
		Loan repayment	$\text{repayment}_{ijl} = \mathbf{1}(\text{loan } l \text{ repaid})$
	R1	Effective tenure (defined for loans that have been repaid)	$\text{effective tenure}_{ijl}$ $= \text{repayment date}_{ijl}$ $- \text{disbursement date}_{ijl}$
	R2	Late repayment	$\text{Late repayment}_{ijl}$ $= \mathbf{1}(\text{effective tenure}_{ijl} > \text{tenure}_{ijl}) +$ $\mathbf{1}(\text{repayment}_{ijl} = 0 \ \& \ \text{end date} < \text{due date}_{ijl})$
	R3	Default	$\text{Default}_{ijl} = \mathbf{1}(\text{effective tenure}_{ijl}$ $> \text{tenure}_{ijl}$ $+ 90 \text{ days}) +$ $\mathbf{1}(\text{repayment}_{ijl}$ $= 0 \ \& \ \text{end date} + 90 \text{ days}$ $< \text{due date}_{ijl})$
	R4	Early repayment	$\text{Early repayment}_{ijl}$ $= \mathbf{1}(\text{effective tenure}_{ijl} < \text{tenure}_{ijl})$
Pricing	P2	APR	$\text{APR}_{ijl} = \left( \frac{\text{Cost}_{il}}{\text{value}_{ijl}^d} \frac{365 \text{ days}}{\text{Tenure}_{ijl}} \right) \times 100\%$
	P3	Effective APR (EAPR)	$\text{EAPR}_{ijl}$ $= \left( \frac{\text{Cost}_{ijl}}{\text{value}_{ijl}^d} \frac{365 \text{ days}}{\text{Effective tenure}_{ijl}} \right) \times 100\%$

Multiple accounts		Number of accounts	$N_i^j = \sum_{j=1}^{N^j} \mathbf{1}(N_j^d > 0)$
	MA1	Multiple account holding	Multiple accounts <sub>i</sub> = $\mathbf{1}(N_i^j > 1)$
		Overlapping loan	$\begin{aligned} \text{overlapping}_{ijl} &= \mathbf{1}(\text{disbursement date}_{ikm} < \text{disbursement date}_{ijl} < \text{repayment date}_{ikm}) \\ &+ \mathbf{1}(\text{disbursement date}_{ijl} < \text{disbursement date}_{ikm} < \text{repayment date}_{ijl}) \end{aligned}$ <p>for loan <math>m</math> taken by <math>i</math> at provider <math>k \neq j</math>.</p>
		Simultaneous loan	$\begin{aligned} \text{simultaneous}_{ijl} &= \mathbf{1}(\text{disbursement date}_{ijl} \\ &= \text{disbursement date}_{ikm}) \end{aligned}$
		Refinancing loan	$\begin{aligned} \text{refinancing}_{ijl} &= \mathbf{1}(\text{disbursement date}_{ijl} \\ &= \text{repayment date}_{ikm}) \end{aligned}$
		Refinanced loan	$\begin{aligned} \text{refinanced}_{ijl} &= \mathbf{1}(\text{repayment date}_{ijl} \\ &= \text{disbursement date}_{ikm}) \end{aligned}$
	MA2	Multiple borrowing	$\begin{aligned} \text{Multiple borrowing}_i &= \mathbf{1} \left( \sum_{j=1}^{N^j} \sum_{l=1}^{N_j^a} \text{overlapping}_{ijl} \right. \\ &\quad \left. + \text{simultaneous}_{ijl} > 0 \right) \end{aligned}$

	MA3	Switching borrowing	Switching borrowing <sub><i>i</i></sub> = (1 – Multiple borrowing <sub><i>i</i></sub> ) × Multiple accounts <sub><i>i</i></sub>
Credit screening		Application record	application <sub><i>ijlt</i></sub>
		Number of applications <i>l</i> by consumer <i>i</i> at provider <i>j</i>	$N_{ij}^{app}$
		Approvals	approved <sub><i>ijlt</i></sub> = 1 (loan disbursed <sub><i>ijlt</i></sub> )
	A1	Approval rate	Approval rate = $\frac{\sum_{j=1}^J \sum_{i=1}^{N_j^a} \sum_{l=1}^{N_{ij}^{app}} \text{approved}_{ijl}}{\sum_{j=1}^J \sum_{i=1}^{N_j^a} \sum_{l=1}^{N_{ij}^{app}} \text{application}_{ijl}}$
	A2	Number of applications <i>l</i> by consumer <i>i</i> at provider <i>j</i> before approval	$N_{ijt}^{app} = \sum_l^{N_{ij}^{app}} \mathbf{1}(\text{application}_{ijlt} \ \& \ t < \tau)$ where $\tau$ is the time at which the first loan is approved.
		Covariates	A vector $\mathbf{x}_{ijlt}$ which encapsulates information known about applicant <i>i</i> at time <i>t</i> for loan <i>l</i> , at provider <i>j</i> .